1	THE HEARING RESUMED AS FOLLOWS ON THE 5TH FEBRUARY, 1999:
2	
3	CHAIRMAN: Just a moment Mr. Allen please.
4	
5	Ladies and gentlemen, good morning.
6	
7	As a result of the unauthorised disclosure of confidential
8	Tribunal information last year the Tribunal made a number
9	of complaints to An Garda Siochana. The Gardai instituted
10	a criminal investigation as a result of these complaints.
11	
12	Following upon this latest unauthorised disclosure I again
13	sought the assistance of the Garda Siochana with a view to
14	establishing the source of this disclosure. I am now
15	informed by the Garda Siochana that their investigations
16	are at an advanced stage.
17	
18	Having consulted with them, who I believe were in contact
19	with the Director of Public Prosecutions, I have decided
20	that it would not be in the public interest to pursue my
21	present inquiry in public pending the completion of the
22	current Garda investigation, and accordingly I will resume
23	this particular investigation at a later stage when the
24	Garda investigation is completed.
25	
26	MR. HANRATTY: Sir, as you are aware the Tribunal has been
27	in contact with the solicitor for Independent Newspapers,
28	and I think in view of what you have just said it would be
29	appropriate to leave over any information regarding that
30	until this matter is resumed after the conclusion of the
31	Garda investigation.
32	

1	CHAIRMAN: Yes.
2	
3	MR. HANRATTY: But apart from the question of evidence
4	sir, there are still a number of outstanding matters which
5	I think can be dealt with today, or at least I would hope
6	can be dealt with today.
7	
8	The first one sir, is the question of the two transcripts
9	of the interviews which took place in May and June of last
10	year between Counsel to the Tribunal and two officials from
11	Anglo Irish Bank PLC.
12	
13	In view of the information which has got out into the
14	public realm before any significant evidence on the issue
15	has been given, and in view of the fact that the
16	information which has got out is the same, deals with the
17	same subject matter as that which is dealt with in the
18	transcripts, it appears to me sir, that its not
19	unreasonable for the Tribunal to ask Mr. Allen to indicate
20	whether his client in these particular circumstances would
21	be willing to consent to the Tribunal using these
22	transcripts of these two interviews with Anglo Irish Bank,
23	as you are aware they were sent back after the Supreme
24	court ruling, but that given the information which has now
25	emerged into the public realm that they consent to the use
26	of these transcripts without these officials having to be
27	reinterviewed, as it were, by Counsel to the Tribunal.
28	That's the first point.
29	
30	The second point sir, is that as a result of the disclosure
31	of the information which appeared in this article on Sunday
32	and the inquiry which emanated from it, and in particular

1	the reference to the three documents which were the
2	appendices to the narrative statement submitted by Anglo
3	Irish Bank, again I think it is not unreasonable for the
4	Tribunal to ask Mr. Allen his client's position as to
5	whether he is willing to consent these three documents now
6	be used by the Tribunal in whatever way it thinks
7	appropriate without the conditions which they have hitherto
8	sought to attach to the use of those documents.
9	
10	If I just briefly refer you, sir, to their letter of the,
11	letter from Smith Foy and Partners, dated 29th of January,
12	of 1999. This was in response to a Tribunal letter in
13	relation to these three documents. If you recall, sir, the
14	documents consist of the cheque for £50,000 from Anglo
15	Irish to Michael and Tom Bailey in which the crossing was
16	removed; the two contracts, because the land was sold from
17	two different companies, one large lot and a small lot; and
18	the handwritten notes which have also been referred to.
19	
20	The Tribunal was in communication with Smith Foy in regard
21	to these documents, and in this letter of the 29th of
22	January, of 1999, Messrs. Smith Foy say as follows:
23	
24	"Dear Miss Howard,
25	
26	I refer to your letter of the 28th inst., and note the
27	contents thereof.
28	
29	For the avoidance of doubt, my clients are prepared to
30	consent to the making of the proposed order on the basis
31	that any document so produced remain confidential and the
32	statement of Anglo Irish Bank Corporation PLC is not

1	circulated to persons other than the Sole Member and the
2	Tribunal legal team. In the event that the Tribunal
3	intends to treat the documents and statements in the manner
4	outlined in your letter, we object to the making of the
5	order and wish to make oral submissions to the Sole
6	Member."
7	
8	Now, in my respectful submission, sir, that condition is
9	quite ludicrous, because it effectively means that they are
10	consenting to the Tribunal having the documents provided
11	they don't use them.
12	
13	The normal course for documents, sir, as you are aware, is
14	that documents which are identified as documents which may
15	be relevant to issues before the Tribunal are made the
16	subject of an order after due notice to the party
17	affected. If having considered the document, the Tribunal
18	is of the view that they are relevant, to a particular
19	issue, they are then circulated to the parties who may be
20	affected by that issue, and ultimately subject to any
21	submissions anybody may make with regard to admissibility
22	are put in evidence before the Tribunal.
23	
24	The condition which is sought to be imposed in this letter
25	effectively says "you can have the documents provided you
26	don't use them, provided they are not circulated to anybody
27	other than the Tribunal legal team".
28	
29	In my respectful submission, sir, given what has come out
30	now, unfortunately through the publication of this material
31	in the Independent and the investigation which subsequently
32	ensued, it is quite clear beyond any possibility of

1	argument that each of these three documents are clearly not
2	only relevant but fundamental to the issue of the £50,000
3	cash payment on the 23rd of November, and it seems to me
4	absurd that we should be engaging in ongoing correspondence
5	attaching conditions to the Tribunal getting these
6	documents.
7	
8	So I ask, sir, you to invite My Friend to indicate whether
9	his client is prepared to consent now without further
10	preconditions that the Tribunal has the documents and can
11	deal with them in whatever way it considers appropriate.
12	
13	Sorry, it was a cash withdrawal, sir, I think I used "cash
14	payment", I understand it was a cash withdrawal. This is
15	the £50,000 cheque.
16	
17	Miss Howard also draws my attention, she was the one, as
18	you are aware, sir, was engaged in the correspondence, she
19	draws my attention to the fact that the correspondence
20	related not just to these three documents but to the entire
21	Discovery. You do remember in the course of the evidence
22	Mr. Bailey was of the view there was only three documents
23	in the file, but in fact Mr. Brown from Anglo Irish told us
24	it was a significant sized file. I think that is, in fact,
25	the correct position.
26	
27	The correspondence, including this condition, the condition
28	was sought to be applied not just to the three documents
29	but to the entire file, and it seems to me, sir, the entire
30	Anglo Irish file is relevant. There may be some document
31	peripheral to it but I can't think of any reason why the
32	entire file should not be made available to the Tribunal.

1	
2	The third matter which arises, sir, arose on the last day,
3	and I raised it at the outset when I drew your attention to
4	the publication of this article in the Independent on
5	Wednesday. That was that in circumstances where this
6	information with this level of detail, and you will recall
7	the six factual assertions which I identified in that
8	article; given the emergence into the public realm of that
9	information, that it was not unreasonable that the Tribunal
10	should invite Mr. Allen on behalf of his client to indicate
11	whether he is now in a position to state to the Tribunal
12	those, does the substance of that article accurately
13	reflect the case that he is making to this Tribunal?
14	
15	It appears to me, sir, it is time My Friend, Mr. Allen,
16	stopped playing games on this issue and informed the
17	Tribunal directly what is the position. Does the material
18	contained in that article actually represent the case his
19	client is making or does it not? I cannot think of any
20	good reason whatsoever why that information should not now
21	be given to this Tribunal in these circumstances.
22	
23	Fourthly, if it does represent the case that My Friend's
24	client is making, is there any good reason why he should
25	not now submit to the Tribunal a detailed statement of his
26	account in relation to this particular transaction? It
27	seems to me, sir, it is entirely reasonable that the
28	Tribunal should request these four matters to be dealt with
29	and to be dealt with now.
30	
31	If necessary My Friend can have a break, I respectfully
32	submit, to take instructions if he considers he requires to

1	do so. It seems to me, sir, these are four simple
2	matters, important matters and they are matters, some of
3	which are the subject of ongoing and, in my opinion, my
4	respectful submission unnecessary correspondence, and it
5	seems to me in circumstances where this material has now
6	emerged into the public realm it is about time this
7	Tribunal was given the assistance of dealing with these
8	four simple matters which are fundamental to this
9	particular issue of the £50,000 payment.
10	
11	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Allen?
12	
13	MR. ALLEN: Thank you, Chairman. I am obliged for the
14	offer of time to consider the position but I don't actually
15	require it sir, and I can respond to what has been said.
16	
17	What I specifically wish to refer to, sir, is your opening,
18	your brief opening statement, in which you very properly
19	and very fairly brought to the attention of all the parties
20	to this Tribunal developments which have arisen since this
21	inquiry into this leaked material arose, commenced the day
22	before yesterday.
23	
24	I think that it is only right that the propriety and
25	fairness of you having done so in the manner in which you
26	did so at the commencement of the sitting should be
27	recognised and acknowledged and I am personally grateful
28	for it.
29	
30	I would lead on from there, sir, to make the point that it
31	seems to me that you have, yourself, established that there
32	is a new and potentially extremely serious dimension to

1	this entire affair. You, yourself, and I know that you
2	will correct me if I am misquoting you or misstating you,
3	sir, you, yourself, as I understand it, indicated that you
4	had once again, and quite properly, may I say, sought the,
5	with respect, sought the assistance of An Garda Siochana,
6	and you also referred to the Director of Public
7	Prosecutions.
8	
9	You also indicated, sir, that you felt that in all of the
10	circumstances that it would be inappropriate for you,
11	having regard to matters to which, which are entirely
12	within your knowledge, and again properly entirely within
13	your knowledge and of which I seek no detail whatever, nor
14	would I be entitled in my view to seek any such detail, but
15	having regard to that fact, sir, as I understand it, you
16	indicated that you considered it inappropriate to continue
17	with this particular, with your inquiry until such time as
18	the various matters which you brought to the attention of
19	this public session had been attended to.
20	
21	Now, I welcome that approach, sir, it seems to me to be the
22	correct approach to adopt, if I may respectfully say so.
23	But it leads me to this, sir; having regard to what you
24	have had to say, and having listened to what Mr. Hanratty
25	has had to say, with respect, I say that I wish and I am
26	not talking by the way for the avoidance of doubt of a ten
27	minute interval I wish to reserve and consider my
28	position.
29	
30	You will recall that in relation to, what Mr. Hanratty
31	Mr. Hanratty is seeking a variety of acknowledgments under
32	the guise of what he characterises as assistance.

1	So-be-it. What I am saying, and you will recall, for
2	example, that Mr. Leahy in my absence on the morning on
3	which this matter broke, specifically reserved my client's
4	position in relation to this matter on the question of
5	having, indicating that he had dealt with this entire issue
6	under the rubric of what I might refer to as "the
7	cross-examination rule".
8	
9	So the position, sir, is that however Mr. Hanratty seeks
10	and chooses to criticise my clients, and by inference his
11	legal advisors, I follow what you say, sir, and I am guided
12	by what you say in this matter. It seems to me that it
13	would be entirely inappropriate for me, on behalf of my
14	clients, to make any decision of any kind, sir, until the
15	matter which you have referred to have been brought to a
16	close.
17	
18	And I say that, sir, I am, I want to make it clear, that I
19	am deliberately avoiding responding to the pejorative and
20	unhelpful language employed by Mr. Hanratty in addressing
21	you. I don't propose to do so.
22	
23	I am directing myself entirely to what you have had to say,
24	sir, and it seems to me that, with the greatest of respect,
25	as night follows day that having regard to what you have
26	said, that it is entirely legitimate and proper for myself
27	and Mr. Leahy and Mr. Simons and Mr. Smith to take such a
28	course as we consider appropriate, and that course does
29	not, sir, include furnishing, or consenting to the requests
30	at this stage, to the requests made by Mr. Hanratty.
31	
32	I thank you, sir.

1	•
2	MR. HANRATTY: Sir, could I just very briefly say, as I
3	understand My Friend what he is seeking is an adjournment,
4	and effectively an opportunity not to deal with the matters
5	I have raised.
6	
7	All I am asking for, is can we use the transcripts of the
8	interviews last year so we don't have to reinterview these
9	two bank officials? Can we get on with the inquiry and
10	have the three appendices? Can Mr. Allen just tell us
11	whether what was published on Wednesday's independent is
12	his case or not? And if it is, can he give us another
13	statement? That is all I am asking. There is no need for
14	another adjournment. If he wants you to rise, sir, to take
15	instructions he can be given that facility. It seems they
16	are four simple requests. The objective is to enable the
17	Tribunal to progress the inquiry expeditiously. I can't
18	think of any reason why each of these matters should not be
19	forthcoming. It should be put to Mr. Allen to take
20	instructions as to whether his client who has repeatedly
21	asserted that he is willing to cooperate, that it should be
22	put up to Mr. Allen whether he will get instructions to
23	cooperate in that particular way.
24	
25	CHAIRMAN: Mr. Allen, in the first instance may I say that
26	the requests for assistance from you are not new, and I may
27	say that what you have just said was very elegant and very
28	courteous, and I am very delighted to see it between us,
29	reservation of your situation and in fact a refusal of my
30	request, but that being what it appears, would you now tell
31	me what is the position? I just want to know what is your
32	position in relation to the bank papers?

1	
2	When I use the phrase "bank papers" I am including the
3	transcripts, shall we call it the transcripts which are in
4	limbo at the moment.
5	
6	MR. ALLEN: Well, if I could respond to that in this way,
7	sir; you are quite right by the way I hope that I
8	wasn't, that I didn't, that I was making myself abundantly
9	clear when I say I was refusing Mr. Hanratty's request.
10	
11	CHAIRMAN: Most elegantly done.
12	
13	MR. ALLEN: Thank you, sir. And I repeat, the refusal,
14	subject to this, sir, there are two inquiries, as I
15	understand it, in progress which have a direct bearing and
16	relevance on the documentation which is being sought. One
17	of them is an inquiry which you have, in my respectful
18	submission, very properly determined to adjourn pending the
19	completion of another inquiry which you have told us, which
20	is an inquiry on an entirely different plain, being the
21	inquiry by An Garda Siochana. Now, that is the fact.
22	
23	There are two inquiries, all of them bearing on these
24	documentations, and in those circumstances, sir, I am
25	reserving with, and I do so with respect, I am reserving my
26	position. I am not in a position now, nor will I disclose
27	what our position is in relation to any of these
28	documents.
29	•
30	I want to reflect upon what has come up on what you have
31	said this morning, and I emphasise what you have said this
32	morning. I want to reflect on that.

1	
2	I want to consider all of those matters, and I also want, I
3	also feel that I should make it clear, sir, that Mr.
4	Hanratty's suggestion that it should be put up to Mr.
5	Allen, or put up to
6	
7	CHAIRMAN: Let's leave the language and keep in the
8	language of diplomacy which you have been employing this
9	morning.
10	
11	MR. ALLEN: I am not using my language, I am quoting from
12	your own counsel.
13	
14	CHAIRMAN: Let's keep it with in the diplomatic language.
15	
16	MR. ALLEN: But the reason that I refer to that, sir, I am
17	not seeking to engage in the level that Mr. Hanratty has
18	engaged in, what I want to make clear is that the
19	suggestion that we should with a gun to our head and
20	respond, I am not saying that is coming from you, sir, I
21	know it isn't, because you have specifically made it clear
22	that it is not, I want that on the record, and I want it to
23	be on the record that I have said it to you.
24	
25	What I am saying is that I require, as leader of the
26	Bailey/Bovale legal team
27	
28	CHAIRMAN: Did you say the Baby/Bovale or the Bailey?
29	
30	MR. ALLEN: I hope I said and I hope the transcript will
31	show that I said the Bailey/Bovale legal team, I want to

consult with my colleagues and I do not --

1	
2	CHAIRMAN: There is no problem with that.
3	
4	MR. ALLEN: Bear with me for a moment; I am not going to
5	do it at the dictat of Mr. Hanratty in ten minutes, fifteen
6	minutes or twenty minutes. I am saying at the moment, for
7	now, I am declining each and every one of Mr. Hanratty's
8	requests, and I feel I should make this point; having
9	regard to what Mr. Hanratty has consistently laid at our
10	door, that in so doing I am doing no more than asserting my
11	client's rights. And if that be obstruction, and if that
12	be a lack of cooperation that's a matter of which you have
13	to determine.
14	-
15	I am saying that my clients are entitled to consult, but
16	for the moment, sir, the answer to Mr. Hanratty's questions
17	and your own questions, sir, I say with the greatest
18	respect, I am anxious to deal with your questions, is no.
19	
20	We are not going to answer those questions now. We are
21	reserving our position. And we will not, we will not have
22	formulated the position during the course of this morning,
23	or of this afternoon, but we will come before you tomorrow
24	morning and we will answer those questions, if that suits
25	you.
26	
27	CHAIRMAN: You are very hard-working on Saturday morning
28	very hard working and enthusiastic. We will open on
29	Saturday for you, if you would like us, but may I put it to
30	you this way, Mr. Allen; let's get to the realities of
31	life, I want to know what is the position in relation to
32	the bank papers? Now, you are perfectly entitled, and I

1	wholeheartedly agree that you are entitled to a reasonable
2	opportunity to consider your position. I likewise have to
3	progress this matter, and I can bring it to a head in a
4	perfectly legitimate and perfectly courteous manner by
5	issuing a motion, or whatever you like to call it, for
6	Discovery which you will be responding, no doubt, to in a
7	private session that is normally done in a private session,
8	as you know.
9	
10	Basically, I don't want to see the Discovery delayed, for
11	the simple reason we are coming up to a point in time which
12	is going to be material in the course of proceedings, very
13	material.
14	
15	Now, could you indicate to me would you be in a position by
16	Monday morning, otherwise I will
17	
18	MR. HANRATTY: Can I suggest, sir, this afternoon, I think
19	that would have there is an issue, sir, I should draw
20	your attention to in the correspondence. It has been
21	indicated in that same letter which I referred you to, that
22	in the event that the Tribunal was not prepared to consent
23	to the condition which they were seeking to impose, they
24	wished to make oral submissions to the Tribunal.
25	
26	Now, we are now at hearing and at public hearing, and it
27	seems to me if they want to go down this road of the
28	Tribunal having to exercise the statutory powers to make an
29	order for the production of these documents and to give
30	notice in accordance with the Supreme Court's requirement
31	to them, so as to enable them to make oral submissions,
32	might I suggest My Friend should make the submissions this

1	afternoon so we can progress the matter.	It seems to me

2 this has been rumbling on in correspondence for some time

- 3 now.
- 4 .
- 5 CHAIRMAN: Mr. Allen, let's take it stage by stage. There
- 6 is undoubtedly considerable correspondence about the
- 7 Discovery, and you have made your point.
- 8 .
- 9 MR. ALLEN: Two letters.
- 10 .
- 11 CHAIRMAN: Yes, you have made your point. It seems to me
- 12 that presumably you have given consideration to this whole
- matter and may well be in a position to deal with it this
- afternoon as to the right to Discovery.
- 15 .
- MR. ALLEN: Sir, if you just bear with me for a moment
- 17 while I respond to that point. It all goes back to what
- 18 you have said.
- 19 .
- 20 I think that would not be unreasonable if it wasn't for the
- announcement which you made at the commencement.
- 22 .
- 23 CHAIRMAN: What announcement?
- 24 .
- MR. ALLEN: What you, yourself, sir, referred to as a "new
- dimension" and the involvement of An Garda Siochana, the
- 27 involvement of An Garda Siochana and the suspension of this
- 28 inquiry.
- 29 .
- 30 All I ask, sir, is this, and I don't think it is
- 31 unreasonable. There is a suggestion that there has been
- 32 prolonged correspondence in relation to this matter. The

,

1	correspondence extends to precisely two letters, one from
2	you
3	
4	MR. HANRATTY: That's incorrect, sir, there are at least
5	half a dozen letters.
6	
7	CHAIRMAN: There has been some correspondence, we are not
8	going to get into details.
9	
10	MR. ALLEN: I am not trying to be unhelpful, I am seeking
11	fairness for my client. I am saying I will deal with this
12	matter fully and unequivocally on Monday morning, but I am
13	asking for that time. And if you wish to sit early, sir,
14	on Monday morning so as to avoid losing time in terms of
15	the continuing evidence of Mr. Gogarty, I have no
16	difficulty with that whatever, but I do urge upon you, sir,
17	in the light of what you have said, and having regard to
18	the considerations which that gives rise to for us, that we
19	be afforded until Monday morning, on my undertaking to deal
20	with the matter.
21	
22	CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Allen, I have every wish to
23	accommodate you within reason, but Monday morning is a full
24	discussion of your, the right of the parties in relation to
25	the study of documents, rights in law and the rights in
26	fact. That's going to be determined.
27	
28	Secondly, lest there is any implication on your part with
29	what you said that this Tribunal is going to, is its
30	principle duty, in anyway defer to a Garda investigation of
31	an aspect which is really collateral to it, may I make it
32	quite clear that that will not be entertained, I thought

JO17

- there might be an implication, if there isn't, there
 isn't.
 .
- 4 MR. ALLEN: Absolutely none, sir, none whatever.

- 5 .
- 6 CHAIRMAN: That's a collateral issue.
- 7
- 8 MR. ALLEN: There is no suggestion of that on my part,
- 9 sir.
- 10 .
- 11 CHAIRMAN: Now, the situation is this; I would appreciate
- it, I think it is a reasonable request that the principles
- of your submission, the headings should be submitted by the
- 14 close of business this afternoon.
- 15 .
- MR. ALLEN: That I can undertake to do, sir.
- 17
- 18 CHAIRMAN: And secondly, I think that the discussion, are
- we talking about half an hour or more on Monday morning?
- 20 .
- 21 MR. ALLEN: I would have thought half an hour
- approximately, Chairman, on our part.
- 23 .
- 24 CHAIRMAN: Well, do you want to deal with this in
- 25 private?
- 26 .
- 27 MR. ALLEN: My understanding, Chairman, is--
- 28 .
- 29 CHAIRMAN: The normal way -- it is a question of this
- 30 debate.
- 31
- 32 MR. ALLEN: You will recall, Chairman, in relation to the

31

32

,

18

1	broad sweep of Discovery that there was an agreement
2	arrived at which you, yourself, were kind enough to
3	describe as "pragmatic" amongst counsel, and the manner
4	which it would be dealt with included you sitting in
5	private to take submissions.
6	
7	I was
8	
9	CHAIRMAN: Right, I will sit at half past nine and defer
10	the sitting of Mr. Gogarty, when I say the public sitting
11	until half past ten, if it takes as little time to come
12	from that building down to this. We will resume our
13	hearing in public at half past ten.
14	
15	In the interim period between half past nine and half past
16	ten we will discuss in private, in private session the
17	question as to whether, what the extent and scope of the
18	Discovery, put it that way.
19	
20	MR. ALLEN: Indeed sir. I believe I will be in a position
21	to assist you.
22	
23	CHAIRMAN: If you will be good enough to set out the
24	headings one way or another, the limitations.
25	
26	MR. ALLEN: You will have those, sir, by 4 o'clock this
27	afternoon. I am obliged to you, Chairman, and I express
28	my thanks for the facility.
29	

MR. HANRATTY: Sir, could I just say that deals with the

second point I raised, which is the Anglo Irish documents.

May I take it My Friend's undertaking to deal with these

1	matters extends to dealing with Points 1, 3 and 4 at the
2	public sitting on Monday morning; that is the question of
3	the transcripts, and indicating to the Tribunal what his
4	position is about the article and the additional statement
5	if it arises.
6	
7	MR. ALLEN: For the avoidance of doubt. Yes.
8	
9	CHAIRMAN: That's nice and simple, that's nice and
10	simple.
11	
12	MR. ALLEN: I hope Mr. Hanratty understands that.
13	
14	CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for your cooperation this
15	morning. I don't think there is any other business. In
16	those circumstances there is no other business here this
17	morning and I am going to adjourn to, not tomorrow morning,
18	to Monday morning. Goodbye everybody, have a pleasant
19	weekend.
20	
21	THE HEARING THEN ADJOURNED TO MONDAY THE 8TH FEBRUARY
22	1999.
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	